

Appeal No. VA14/4/020

AN BINSE LUACHÁLA
VALUATION TRIBUNAL
AN tACHT LUACHÁLA, 2001
VALUATION ACT, 2001

Aldi

APPELLANT

and

Commissioner of Valuation

RESPONDENT

In relation to the issue of Quantum of Valuation in respect of:

Property No. 2213811, Warehouse/Warerooms, at Lot Nos 3G, 3Gb, 3Gc, Mitchelstown, Mitchelstown, Mitchelstown 1, County Cork.

JUDGMENT OF THE VALUATION TRIBUNAL
ISSUED ON THE 28TH DAY OF MAY, 2015

Before

Barry Smyth – FRICS, FSCSI, MCI, Arb **Chairperson/Deputy Chairperson**

Mairead Hughes – Hotelier **Member**

James Browne – BL **Member**

By Notice of Appeal received on the 18th day of November, 2014 the Appellant appealed against the determination of the Commissioner of Valuation in fixing a rateable valuation of €10,380 on the above described relevant property on the grounds as set out in the Notice of Appeal as follows:

"The valuation is excessive and does not reflect the special issues of the property."

The Tribunal, having examined the particulars of the property the subject of this appeal; having confirmed its valuation history; having examined and considered the written evidence and having heard, on the 17th day of February, 2015, the oral evidence adduced before us by the parties to the appeal, represented by Ms Siobhán Murphy of GVA O Buachalla for the appellant and Mr Dean Robinson of the Valuation Office for the respondent,

DETERMINES

That the net annual value of the subject property be as set out below:

Offices	2,687.82 sq. metres @ €41.00 per sq. metre	€ 110,200.62
Ambient Warehouse	47,325.44 sq. metres @ €34.17 per sq. metre	€1,617,110.20
Agreed areas of Net Annual Value		<u>€275,888.00</u>
	NAV	€2,003,198.82
	@ 0.5% =	€10,015.99
	RV Say	€10,000.00

The reasons being as follows:

1. This is a modern purpose-built supermarket group distribution centre built to their required design and with various types of buildings including offices, ambient warehousing and cold storage facilities.
2. Lidl's Distribution Centre in Charleville, PN 2181331, is the best comparison in that it is a modern and purpose-built supermarket group distribution centre and the accommodation, although smaller than the subject, comprises a similar range of uses as the subject. This comparison was introduced by both the appellant and the respondent.
3. The location of the subject premises relative to the motorways and main roads is more convenient than the Lidl location in Charleville.
4. The subject is larger than the Lidl facility but its better location offsets any quantity allowance. The Tribunal finds that the rate of €34.17 per sq. metre is appropriate for the ambient warehouse.

5. The comparisons put forward for the office element of the accommodation range from €68.34 per sq. metre and €45 per sq. metre in Musgrave's in Cork City, PN 929439 and Valuation Tribunal judgment **VA07/3/014 – Musgraves Ltd.**, to €41 per sq. metre in Dairygold in Mitchelstown, PN 1015831 and PN 1532400; €41 per sq. metre on PN 2186777, also in Mitchelstown; €41 per sq. metre on the Lidl unit in Charleville; and €54.67 per sq. metre on a gross internal area basis in Breo Foods in Mitchelstown, PN 2200089. The Tribunal is of the view that a figure of €41 per sq. metre for the office accommodation represents the tone of the list for the subject type of offices.

6. The appellant and respondent were *ad idem* on the rate per sq. metre to be applied to the other areas of the premises.

And the Tribunal so determines.